A Letter to Washington State Governor Jay Inslee  
In Regards to Defending Science-Based Salmon Recovery Policy

Governor Jay Inslee  
Office of the Governor  
PO Box 40002  
Olympia, WA 98504-0002

Dear Governor Inslee,

We, the undersigned fishery and environmental scientists, are writing to let you know of our deep concerns regarding the June 15, 2018 decision by the Washington State Department of Fish and Wildlife Commission (FWC) to suspend key policy guidelines of their 2009 Hatchery and Fishery Reform Policy (POL-C3619), while it undergoes a 6-12-month review. (A copy of the policy is attached).

The reason the FWC adopted the Hatchery Reform Policy in 2009 was “to advance the conservation and recovery of wild salmon and steelhead by promoting and guiding the implementation of hatchery reform.” The Policy’s stated intent was to improve hatchery effectiveness, ensure compatibility between hatchery production and salmon recovery and rebuilding programs, and support sustainable fisheries.

It is important, here, to point out that shortly after the Endangered Species Act (ESA) listing of Puget Sound Chinook salmon in 1998, Congress recognized that hatchery fish spawning with wild fish significantly reduced the genetic fitness of wild fish. They also recognized that hatchery fish comprised most of the commercial, tribal and recreational harvest. To address this obvious conflict between the need to maintain fishing opportunity and at the same time meet the ESA requirement to protect and recover wild fish, Congress with support from Governor Gary Locke established and funded a group of independent scientists in 2000, the Hatchery Scientific Review Group (HSRG). The HSRG was charged with reviewing the hatchery management practices of state, federal and tribal hatcheries, and making recommendations to Congress on how to manage hatcheries consistent with the requirements of the ESA and recovery of wild salmon and steelhead populations. The HSRG submitted its report, “Hatchery Reform”, to Congress in 2004. A similar report for Columbia River hatcheries was submitted to Congress in 2009.

In 2011, the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) 4(d) rule for salmon and steelhead formally recognized the importance of the HSRG’s Hatchery Reform Report by noting that “NMFS considers the HSRG’s principles, findings, and recommendations important to the advancement and implementation of measures needed to reduce risk of adverse hatchery related effects to natural-origin salmon and steelhead populations.” As you know, just recently the HSRG has worked successfully with the Lummi, Upper Skagit and Tulalip Tribes to develop scientifically credible Hatchery Genetic Management Plans that respect their Treaty Rights and produce hatchery salmon for harvest.

Even the federal courts have ruled that hatchery fish on the spawning grounds undermine the recovery of wild fish and cannot be counted toward recovery of ESA listed populations. The State of Washington has already lost a lawsuit concerning the management of hatchery steelhead because they ignored this fact. So, we do not understand why the FWC suddenly without a full public review, decided to ignore the best available science and not utilize independent scientists, the HSRG, to ensure that the state’s hatcheries are...
managed consistent with the needs of wild fish. It is not only a dangerous precedent regarding the management of our state’s fish and wildlife, it is as short sighted as ignoring the science of climate change. As with climate change, the overwhelming body of science confirms the need to protect wild salmon on the spawning grounds.

We would urge you to personally review the recent action by the Fish and Wildlife Commission to suspend the principles, standards and recommendations of the HSRG. We would call upon you to take two immediate steps. First, we would urge you to call upon the FWC to immediately reinstate the three key policy guidelines while conducting the Hatchery and Fishery Reform Policy review. Second, the actions of the FWC to suspend the guidelines while conducting the review gives the appearance of an inherent bias against the HSRG. Therefore, we would call upon you to put together a true independent process to review the HSRG recommended principles, standards and recommendations.

Unfortunately, the FWC’s actions have created significant division at a time we can least afford it. We, like you, believe strongly that following the best available science and the use of independent science can bring people together for the common purpose of restoring our salmon runs and Orca Whale populations.

Sincerely,

Andrew Kinziger, PhD  
Professor  
Humboldt State University, Department of Fisheries Biology

Anne Shaffer, PhD  
Executive Director  
Coastal Watershed Institute

C I Goddard, Ph.D.  
Executive Secretary  
Great Lakes Fishery Commission, AFS Fellow, Retired

Christopher Frissell, Ph.D.  
Principal Scientist  
Frissell & Raven Hydrobiological and Landscape Sciences

Conrad Mahnken, Ph.D.  
Former WDFW Commissioner  
WDFW, NOAA-Fisheries, Retired

David Montgomery, PhD  
Professor of Geomorphology  
Department of Earth & Space Sciences, UW

Gene Helfman, PhD  
Professor Emeritus  
Odum School of Ecology, University of Georgia

Jack Stanford, PhD  
Professor Emeritus  
Flathead Lake Biological Station

Julian Olden, PhD  
Professor, SAFS  
University of Washington

Ken Leber, Ph.D.  
Founder  
Science Consortium for Ocean Replenishment

Lance Morgan, PhD  
President  
Marine Conservation Institute

Lars Mobrand, Ph.D.  
Past Chair of HSRG  
HSRG, Retired
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position/Role</th>
<th>Institution/Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matthew Sloat, PhD</td>
<td>Director of Science</td>
<td>Wild Salmon Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Blouin, PhD</td>
<td>Professor, Department of Integrative Biology</td>
<td>Oregon State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nick Gayeski, PhD</td>
<td>Aquatic Ecologist</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Trotter, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Fishery Science Consultant</td>
<td>Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Paquet, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Northwest Power and Conservation Council</td>
<td>Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Williams PhD</td>
<td>Fisheries Ecologist and Research Associate</td>
<td>Department of Biology at The College of Idaho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert J Naiman, PhD</td>
<td>Professor Emeritus</td>
<td>School of Aquatic &amp; Fishery Sciences, UW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Conroy, PhD</td>
<td>Senior Ecologist</td>
<td>King County Department of Transportation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aaron Hill</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Watershed Watch Salmon Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aaron Jorgeson</td>
<td>Biologist</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Brandt</td>
<td>Board of Directors, Secretary</td>
<td>Washington Water Trails Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adrian Tuohy</td>
<td>Biologist</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aileen Jeffries</td>
<td>Senior Research Scientist</td>
<td>Harbor Porpoise Project, Biota Maxima</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan Levine</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Coast Action Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexandra Morton</td>
<td>Founder</td>
<td>Raincoast Conservation Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Carey</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Sound Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andree Hurley</td>
<td>President and Acting Executive Director</td>
<td>Washington Water Trails</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andy Appleby</td>
<td>Hatchery Biologist</td>
<td>WDFW, Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann E Prezyna</td>
<td>Counsel</td>
<td>Lane Powell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chuck Owens</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Peninsula Citizens for the Protection of Whales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleen Weiler, MSc</td>
<td>Jessica Rekos Fellow for Orca Conservation</td>
<td>Whale and Dolphin Conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave Seiler</td>
<td>Research Scientist</td>
<td>WDFW, Retired</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Doug Hennick  
Aquatic Ecologist  
Wild Fish Conservancy

Emma Helverson  
Outreach Coordinator  
Wild Fish Conservancy

Frank Haw  
Director  
Washington Department of Fisheries, Retired

Grace Stiller  
President and Founder  
Nature Stewards Program

Jamie Glasgow  
Director of Ecology  
Wild Fish Conservancy

Jessica Helsley  
Executive Director  
Coast Salmon Foundation,  
Coast Salmon Partnership

Jim Lichatowich  
Fishery Biologist and Author  
Retired

Jim Martin  
Chief of Fisheries  
ODFW, Salmon Advisor to Governor Kitzhaber, Retired

John Barr  
Chief Enhancement Biologist  
Nisqually Tribe, HSRG, Retired

John Brosnan  
Executive Director  
Seattle Audubon Society

John C. McGlenn  
President  
Washington Wildlife Federation

John Kober  
Executive Director  
Pacific Rivers

John Sneva  
Biologist  
WDFW

Johnny Le Coq  
Founder and CEO  
Fishpond

Juan Carlos Cardenas N.  
Executive Director, Veterinary Doctor  
Centro Ecocanados, Santiago de Chile

Justin Eastman  
Biologist  
Wild Fish Conservancy

Karen G. Wristen  
Executive Director  
Living Oceans Society

Kurt Beardslee  
Executive Director  
Wild Fish Conservancy

Lee Blankenship  
Senior Research Scientist  
WDFW, Retired

Lorna Smith  
Vice-President  
Olympic Forest Coalition

Maradel K. Gale  
Executive Director  
Bainbridge Beach Naturalists

Marcie Keever  
Director, Oceans & Vessels Program  
Friends of the Earth

Maria Meyer  
Community Outreach Administrator  
Central Co-op
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mark Greenwood</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Kitsap-Olympic Peninsula Chapter #383 of Trout Unlimited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Sherwood</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Native Fish Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Lou White</td>
<td>Field Biologist</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megan Adams</td>
<td>Biologist</td>
<td>Raincoast Conservation Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micah Wait</td>
<td>Director of Conservation</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misty MacDuffee</td>
<td>Wild Salmon Program Director</td>
<td>Raincoast Conservation Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noah Greenwald</td>
<td>Endangered Species Director</td>
<td>Center for Biological Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Hanratty</td>
<td>Biologist</td>
<td>WDFW, Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Myers</td>
<td>Director of Outreach and</td>
<td>Wild Fish Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Scientist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Seidel</td>
<td>Regional Hatchery Division</td>
<td>WDFW, Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Bahls</td>
<td>Fish Biologist and Director</td>
<td>Northwest Watershed Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shari Tarantino</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Orca Conservancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stan Moberly</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>American Fisheries Society, Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Erickson</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Whidbey Environmental Action Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Manlow</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Lower Columbia Fish Recovery Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Ballinger</td>
<td>Founder and Lead</td>
<td>Wenatchee Naturalist Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Flagg</td>
<td>Supervisory Fisheries Research</td>
<td>NOAA-Fisheries, Retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Biologist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whitney Neugebauer</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>Whale Scout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fish and Wildlife Commission

Commission Policy Documents

POLICY DECISION

POLICY TITLE: Hatchery and Fishery Reform
Supercodes: N/A

Effective Date: November 6, 2009
Termination Date: Not applicable
Approved by: js/Miranda Wecker
Fish and Wildlife Commission Chair

Purpose
The purpose of this Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife policy is to advance the conservation and recovery of wild salmon and steelhead by promoting and guiding the implementation of hatchery reform.

Definition and Intent
Hatchery reform is the scientific and systematic redesign of hatchery programs to help recover wild salmon and steelhead and support sustainable fisheries. The intent of hatchery reform is to improve hatchery effectiveness, ensure compatibility between hatchery production and salmon recovery plans and rebuilding programs, and support sustainable fisheries.

General Policy Statement
The Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife (Department) shall promote the conservation and recovery of wild salmon and steelhead and provide fishery-related benefits by establishing clear goals for each state hatchery, conducting scientifically defensible operations, and using informed decision making to improve management. Furthermore, it is recognized that many state operated hatcheries are subject to provisions under U.S. v. Washington and U.S. v. Oregon and that hatchery reform actions must be done in close coordination with tribal co-managers.

Artificial production programs will be designated as one of the following:

- Conservation Programs. Artificial production programs implemented with a conservation objective shall have a net aggregate benefit for the diversity, spatial structure, productivity, and abundance of the target wild population.
- Harvest Programs. Artificial production programs implemented to enhance harvest opportunities shall provide fishery benefits while allowing watershed specific goals for the diversity, spatial structure, productivity, and abundance of wild populations to be met.

State commercial and recreational fisheries will need to increasingly focus on the harvest of abundant hatchery fish. As a general policy, the Department shall implement mark-selective salmon and steelhead fisheries, unless the wild populations substantially affected by the fishery are meeting spawner and broodstock management objectives.

In addition, the Department may consider other management approaches provided they are as or more effective than a mark selective fishery in achieving spawner and broodstock management objectives.

Hatchery reform should be implemented as part of an "all-H" strategy that integrates hatchery, harvest, and habitat actions. Although this policy focuses on hatchery and harvest reform, in no way does it diminish the significance of habitat protection and restoration.

In implementing the policy guidelines the Department shall work with the tribes in a manner that is consistent with U.S. v. Washington and U.S. v. Oregon and other applicable state laws and agreements or federal laws and agreements.

Policy Guidelines

1. Use the principles, standards, and recommendations of the Hatchery Scientific Review Group (HSRG) to guide the management of hatcheries operated by the Department. In particular, promote the achievement of hatchery goals through adaptive management based on a structured monitoring, evaluation, and research program.
2. The Department will prioritize and implement improved broodstock management (including selective removal of hatchery fish) to reduce the genotypic and ecological impacts of hatchery fish and improve the fitness and viability of natural production working toward a goal of achieving the HSRG broodstock standards for 100% of the hatchery programs by 2015.
3. Develop watershed-specific action plans that systematically implement hatchery reform as part of a comprehensive, integrated (All-H) strategy for conservation and harvest goals at the watershed and Evolutionarily Significant Unit (ESU)/Distinct Population Segment (DPS) levels. Action Plans will include development of stock (watershed) specific population designations and application of HSRG broodstock management standards. In addition, plans will include a time-line for implementation, strategies for funding, estimated costs including updates to cost figures each biennium.
4. Externally mark all Chinook, coho, and steelhead artificial production that is intended to be used for harvest except as modified by state-tribal agreements or for conservation or research needs.
5. Secure necessary funding to ensure that Department-operated hatchery facilities comply with environmental regulations for passage facilities, water intake screening, and pollutant control systems.
6. Implement hatchery reform actions on a schedule that meets or exceeds the benchmarks identified in the 21st Century Salmon and Steelhead Framework.
7. Provide an annual report to the Fish and Wildlife Commission on progress of implementation.
8. Develop, promote and implement alternative fishing gear to maximize catch of hatchery-origin fish with minimal mortality to native salmon and steelhead.
9. Seek funding from all potential sources to implement hatchery reform and selective fisheries.
10. Define "full implementation" of state-managed mark selective recreational and commercial fisheries and develop an implementation schedule.
11. Work with tribal co-managers to establish network of Wild Salmonid Management Zones (WSMZ) across the state where wild stocks are largely protected from the effects of same species hatchery programs. The Department will have a goal of establishing at least one WSMZ for each species in each major population group (bio-geographical region, strain) in each ESU/DPS. Each stock selected for inclusion in the WSMZ must be sufficiently abundant and productive to be self-sustaining in the future. Fisheries can be conducted in WSMZ if wild stock management objectives are met as well as any necessary federal ESA determinations are received.